

1 LORI A. BOWMAN, State Bar No. 114664
lori.bowman@ogletreedeakins.com
2 LINDA S. GOLDMAN, State Bar No. 193419
linda.goldman@ogletreedeakins.com
3 OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH,
SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.
4 633 West Fifth Street, 53rd Floor
Los Angeles, California 90071
5 Telephone: (213) 239-9800
Facsimile: (213) 239-9045

6 Attorneys for Defendant
7 NORTHWEST AIRLINES, INC.

8 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
9 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
10

11 ORVILLE MEAUX,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 NORTHWEST AIRLINES, INC., DOES 1-
15 10, Inclusive,

16 Defendants.
17

Case No. C 04-04444 CW

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

Trial Date: None

1 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production of
 3 confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
 4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation would be
 5 warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the
 6 following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not
 7 confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the
 8 protection it affords extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled under
 9 the applicable legal principles to treatment as confidential. The parties further
 10 acknowledge, as set forth in Section 10, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order creates
 11 no entitlement to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth
 12 the procedures that must be followed and reflects the standards that will be applied when a
 13 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

14 **2. DEFINITIONS**

15 2.1 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,
 16 employees, consultants, retained experts, and outside counsel (and their support staff).

17 2.2 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the
 18 medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things,
 19 testimony, transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in disclosures or
 20 responses to discovery in this matter.

21 2.3 "Confidential" Information or Items: information (regardless of how
 22 generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under
 23 standards developed under F.R.Civ.P. 26(c).

24 2.4 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from
 25 a Producing Party.

26 2.5 Producing Party: a Party or non-party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
 27 Material in this action.

28 2.6 Designating Party: a Party or non-party that designates information or items

that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “Confidential.”

2.7 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as “Confidential.”

2.8 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well as their support staffs).

2.9 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action and who is not a past or a current employee of a Party or of a competitor of a Party’s and who, at the time of retention, is not anticipated to become an employee of a Party or a competitor of a Party’s. This definition includes a professional jury or trial consultant retained in connection with this litigation.

2.10 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying; videotaping; translating; preparing exhibits or demonstrations; organizing, storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and their employees and subcontractors.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or counsel to or in court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

4. DURATION

Even after the termination of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must

1 take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the
 2 appropriate standards. A Designating Party must take care to designate for protection only
 3 those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify –
 4 so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which
 5 protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

6 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that
 7 are shown to be clearly unjustified, or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
 8 unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process, or to impose unnecessary
 9 expenses and burdens on other parties), expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

10 If it comes to a Party's or a non-party's attention that information or items that it
 11 designated for protection do not qualify for protection at all, or do not qualify for the level
 12 of protection initially asserted, that Party or non-party must promptly notify all other parties
 13 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

14 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
 15 Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a), below), or as otherwise stipulated or
 16 ordered, material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated
 17 before the material is disclosed or produced.

18 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

19 (a) for information in documentary form (apart from transcripts of
 20 depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend
 21 "CONFIDENTIAL" at the top of each page that contains protected material.

22 A Party or non-party that makes original documents or materials available for
 23 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has
 24 indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
 25 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed
 26 "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants
 27 copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions
 28 thereof, qualify for protection under this Order, then, before producing the specified

documents, the Producing Party must affix the appropriate legend (“CONFIDENTIAL”) at the top of each page that contains Protected Material.

(b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the testimony identify on the record, before the close of the deposition, hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony. When it is impractical to identify separately each portion of testimony that is entitled to protection, and when it appears that substantial portions of the testimony may qualify for protection, the Party or non-party that sponsors, offers, or gives the testimony may invoke on the record (before the deposition or proceeding is concluded) a right to have up to 20 days to identify the specific portions of the testimony as to which protection is sought. Only those portions of the testimony that are appropriately designated for protection within the 20 days shall be covered by the provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Transcript pages containing Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter, who must affix to the top of each such page the legend “CONFIDENTIAL,” as instructed by the Party or non-party offering or sponsoring the witness or presenting the testimony.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary, and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portions.

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items as “Confidential” does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. If material is appropriately designated as “Confidential” after the material was initially produced, the Receiving Party, on notification of the designation, must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

1 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

2 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's
3 confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable substantial unfairness,
4 unnecessary economic burdens, or a later significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a
5 Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to
6 mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

7 6.2 Meet and Confer. A Party that elects to initiate a challenge to a Designating
8 Party's confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin the process by
9 conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not
10 sufficient) with counsel for the Designating Party. In conferring, the challenging Party
11 must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and
12 must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to
13 reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the
14 basis for the chosen designation. A challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the
15 challenge process only if it has engaged in this meet and confer process first.

16 6.3 Judicial Intervention. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a
17 confidentiality designation after considering the justification offered by the Designating
18 Party may file and serve a motion under Civil Local Rule 7 (and in compliance with Civil
19 Local Rule 79-5, if applicable) that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in detail
20 the basis for the challenge. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent
21 declaration that affirms that the movant has complied with the meet and confer
22 requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph and that sets forth with specificity the
23 justification for the confidentiality designation that was given by the Designating Party in
24 the meet and confer dialogue.

25 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the
26 Designating Party. Until the court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford
27 the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing
28 Party's designation.

1 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
3 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a non-party in connection with this case only
4 for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material
5 may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in
6 this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with
7 the provisions of section 11, below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

8 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location
9 and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under
10 this Order.

11 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise
12 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party
13 may disclose any information or item designated CONFIDENTIAL only to:

14 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of record in this action, as well
15 as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the
16 information for this litigation and who have reviewed and agreed to be bound by this
17 Stipulation;

18 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
19 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who
20 have reviewed and agreed to be bound by this Stipulation;

21 (c) experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
22 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Agreement
23 to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

24 (d) the Court and its personnel;

25 (e) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom
26 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have reviewed and agreed to
27 be bound by this Stipulation;

28 (f) during their depositions, third party witnesses in the action to whom

disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order” (Exhibit A). Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

(g) the author of the document or the original source of the information

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION.

If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation that would compel disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” the Receiving Party must so notify the Designating Party, in writing (by fax, if possible) immediately and in no event more than three court days after receiving the subpoena or order. Such notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order.

The Receiving Party also must immediately inform in writing the Party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered by the subpoena or order is the subject of this Protective Order. In addition, the Receiving Party must deliver a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order promptly to the Party in the other action that caused the subpoena or order to issue. In addition, the Receiving Party may not produce any Protected Material until fifteen days after the Receiving Party has given written notice to the Designating Party, and only if the Designating Party has taken no steps to protect the Protected Material from further disclosure.

The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested parties to the existence of this Protective Order and to afford the Designating Party in this case an opportunity to try to protect its confidentiality interests in the court from which the subpoena or order issued. The Designating Party shall bear the burdens and the expenses of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a

1 lawful directive from another court.

2 **9. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

3 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
4 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
5 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the
6 Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all
7 copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized
8 disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons
9 to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as
10 Exhibit A.

11 **10. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

12 Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court order secured after
13 appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this
14 action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material
15 must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5.

16 **11. FINAL DISPOSITION**

17 Unless otherwise ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party, within sixty
18 days after the final termination of this action, each Receiving Party must return all
19 Protected Material to the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected
20 Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of
21 reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. With permission in writing from
22 the Designating Party, the Receiving Party may destroy some or all of the Protected
23 Material instead of returning it. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed,
24 the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not
25 the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the sixty day deadline that identifies
26 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed
27 and that affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts,
28 compilations, summaries or other forms of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected

Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence or attorney work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION), above.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: October 22, 2009

DUANE & SELTZER, LLP,

By: /s/ Dean M. Schmidt
Attorneys for Plaintiff

DATED: October 26, 2009

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK
& STEWART, P.C.,

By: /s/ Linda S. Goldman
Attorneys for Defendant Northwest
Airlines, Inc.

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

10/27/09

DATED: _____



Claudia Wilken
United States District Judge

EXHIBIT A**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____
 [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety
 and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District
 Court for the Northern District of California on [date] in the case of _____

**[insert formal name of the case and the number and initials assigned to it by the
 court]**. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated

Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose
 me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will
 not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated
 Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of
 this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
 Northern District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this
 action.

I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
 _____ [print or type full address and telephone
 number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any
 proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

[Printed Name]

[Signature]